Technical Bid Evaluation

PIR #:

Project Title: Dry Blast and Cleaning Convection section F-3301 & F-3201

PR / CMS References #: REQ 25001144

NOTES

* Evaluators can put up balanced weightages, as per case specifics. The pass score is 70 %
* In case of non-applicability evaluator can mention "Not Applicable" BUT no deletion is allowed
* Evaluator can add any extra comments in the "Technical Team Remarks " at the end of form
* In case the criteria / requirement are not set up in the RFP document, evaluators are requested to ask the information before compiling the final results

No.	Evaluation Item (s)	Weightage	ANABEEB	BRIDGE	EXPERTISE	ISOL	POLY-TECH
1	**Scope Compliance**	**15%**	3%	13%	2%	2%	13%
2	**Schedule Compliance** (if any)	**15%**	3%	12%	0%	6%	9%
3	**Constructability / Field Plan** (Method Statement)	**20%**	2%	18%	2%	2%	4%
4	**Relevent work experience**	**25%**	1%	21%	1%	2%	1%
5	**Manpower** (Manpower Loading Chart, Organization Chart)	**10%**	8%	8%	0%	8%	8%
6	**Equipment Loading Chart** (if applicable)	**5%**	4%	4%	2%	4%	4%
7	**QA / QC Plan** (if applicable)	**5%**	4%	4%	0%	4%	4%
8	**Documentation** (Missing Information, Certifications, etc)	**5%**	5%	5%	2%	5%	5%
	Technical Team Recommendations / Weightage Score	**100%**	30%	85%	8%	32%	48%
	Technically Accepted	**Yes / NO**	No	Yes	No	No	No

Technical Team Remarks :

Scoring done against the weightage for the Evaluation items by technical team. Bridge is technically qualified and accepted. Please Refer attached sheets for the Technical Evaluation Comments for the Evalution items.

APPROVALS:

Functional Supervisor / Superintendent:

Signature Abdullah AlMarri

Digitally signed by Abdullah AlMarri
Date: 2023.06.12 08:16:46 +03'00'

Name: Al-Marri, Abdullah H

Date:

Functional Manager:

Signature: Kenneth Sheppard

Digitally signed by Kenneth Sheppard
Date: 2023.06.12 08:21:31 +03'00'

Name: Sheppard, Kenny D (DOA)

Date:

Project Title: **Dry Blast and Cleaning Convection section F-3301 & F-3201** *(To be filled after joint discussion of stake holders, consolidate the comment from relevant stakeholder sheet)*

PR / CMS References #: **REQ 25001144**

Qualitative Analysis (This technical evaluation is only valid for subject scope)

Sr#	Parameters		ANABEEB	BRIDGE	EXPERTISE	ISOL	POLY-TECH	Remarks
1	***Scope Compliance***		**Partially meeting the Scope Compliance** Since it is partnered with 3rd party CTP for cleaning. There are lot of Clause related to additional charges(ID's to Execution which are covering in Lumpsum) for the CTP presence who are outside country and not locals from KSA Requesting to support for Chemical import outside KSA. **In query Anabeeb did not confirm and are checking with concerned authority for approvals and will revert back.**	Meeting the Scope Compliance	**Not Meeting Scope Compliance** Mobilization will be subject to availability of resources at that time and receipt of contract.	Partially meeting the Scope Compliance. Dry Ice / CO2 pellet is spcified as the blasting medium.	Meeting the Scope Compliance.	
2	***Schedule Plan***		Level 1 Schedule Provided. 1) F-3201 - 2 shift for Cleaning 2) F-3301- 3 Shift for Cleaning Provided Timeline is very less compared to previous history.	Level 2 Schedule Provided. Considering F-3301 and F-3201 parrallel work. 1) F-3201 - 8 days for Cleaning 2) F-3301- 8 days for Cleaning Provided Timeline is compared previous history for F-3301 took 8 days.	Not Provided	Level 1 Schedule Provided. 1) F-3201 - 6 Days for Cleaning 2) F-3301- 3 Days for Cleaning Provided Timeline is very less for F-3301 compared previous history and More for F-3201 which have 2 section of bundle.	Level 2 Schedule Provided. 1) F-3301 - 5 Days for Cleaning 2) F-3201- 4 Days for Cleaning Provided Timeline is very less compared previous history for F-3301.	
3	***Constructability Plan(Method statements in detail)***		Method Statement provided 1) Suggesting to create opening on top and middle of convection which will impact schedule and additional work for mechanical. 2) Method statement do not have details method / procedure for cleaning 2) Method Statement not technically accepted by Process Engineering.	Method Statement provided 1) Method statement have details method / procedure for cleaning with respect to each furnace 2)Method Statement accepted technically by Process Engineering	Method Statement provided 1) Method statement is not scope specific for Furnace F-3301 and F-3201. It is showing for Fin fan Fin tubes. 2)Method Statement not accepted technically by Process Engineering	Method Statement provided Method Statement not accepted technically by Process Engineering since Dry Ice / CO2 pellet do not achieve desired results based on previous experience.	Method Statement provided Method Statement not accepted technically by Process Engineering. The method statement do not have clear plan for cleaning in mid section and final inspection criteria.	
4	**Relevant work experience / Safety with Others**		**Experience** Do not have much work experience listed related to scope specific in KSA. Done only 1 job cleaning in SASREF in Y2009 and 1 job in Bahrain in Y2011 **Safety Statics** Average for 3 years from 2020 to 2022 is 0.11 recordable case rate	**Experience:** Provided and have good experience in the scope specific for Furnace convection section fin tube cleaning **Safety Statics:** Average for 3 years from 2020 to 2022 is 0.22 LTIR	**Experience:** Provided with experience in Mechanical, Chemical cleaning and industrial cleaning works **Safety Statics:** Average for 3 years from 2020 to 2022 is 0.02 TRIR	Not Provided	**Experience:** Provided with experience in cleaning Fin Fans. Furnace Convection section Fin tube not specified. **Safety Statics:** Average for 3 years from 2020 to 2022 is 0 TRIR	
5	**Relevant work experience / Safety with Schem**		**Experience** Not worked for scope specific for Furnace External Fin tube dry blasting cleaning. Worked for mechanical, Catalyst change, chemical cleaning and Decontamination, Onsite machining works **Safety :** Average to Good	**Experience** Same technology company air cool experts now TOSL worked through Al Hilal for scope specific for Furnace External Fin tube dry blasting cleaning in Y2018 TA. Air cool experts now TOSL is partnered with Bridge **Safety Statics:** Average to Good	**Experience** Not worked for scope specific for Furnace External Fin tube dry blasting cleaning. Worked for mechanical, Catalyst change **Safety :** Average to Good	**Experience** Not worked for scope specific for Furnace External Fin tube dry blasting cleaning. **Safety :** Average to Good	**Experience** Not worked for scope specific for Furnace External Fin tube dry blasting cleaning. Not work for S-Chem **Safety :**	
6	***Manpower Loading Chart***		Provided (Manpower loading provided separately from Each Furnace)	Provided (Manpower loading provided separately from Each Furnace)	Not Provided	Provided. (Manpower loading provided separately from Each Furnace)	Provided. (Manpower loading provided separately from Each Furnace)	Pls refer "Resource Evaluation" sheet
		Org. Chart	Provided	Provided	Not Provided scope specific	Provided	Provided	
7	***Equipment Resources & Logistics***		Provided (Equipment loading provided separately from Each Furnace)	Provided (Manpower loading provided separately from Each Furnace)	Provided. Equipment Loading is combined for F-3301 and F-3201 which is not separate for each furnace.	Provided. (Equipment loading provided separately from Each Furnace)	Provided. (Manpower loading provided separately from Each Furnace)	Pls refer "Resource Evaluation" sheet
8	***QA/QC Plan***		Generic QA QC Plan Provided	Generic QA QC Plan Provided	Not Provided	Generic QA QC Plan Provided	Generic QA QC Plan Provided	
9	***HSE plan/statistics***		Provided		Provided			
10	**Documentation** (Missing Information, Certifications, etc.)				**Not provided** 1) Schedule 2) Manpower Loading 3) QA/QC Plan			
11	***Subcontracted any service***		CTP is Partner	TOSL is Partner. ACE	No	No	No	

PR / CMS References #: REQ.25001144
Project Title: Dry Blast and Cleaning Convection section F-3301 & F-3201
Resource Loading Comparison/Evaluation Sheet

Ref Sr#	Parameter	Details	ANABEEB	BRIDGE	EXPERTISE	ISOL	POLY TECH	Remarks
Comments			Provided separate manpower loading for both furnace	Provided separate manpower loading for both furnace	Expertise has not submitted the Manpower loading chart in proposal they have mentioned they will submit after award of contract	Provided separate manpower loading for both furnace	Provided separate manpower loading for both furnace	
6	Manpower Loading Chart	**Total Count - Manpower Loading**	**50**	**52**		**48**	**26**	
		Project Lead	0	1		0	0	
		Supervisor/Site supervisor	4	4		4	4	
		CTP Specialist / Chemical Cleaning Technician / Ice blasting technician	12	12		12	8	
		Chemical cleaning foreman / Foreman	0	4		4	0	
		Permit Receiver	4	1		4	0	
		Standby man/Manhole watch	0	4		4	4	
		Fire watch	0	4		0	4	
		Flagman	4	0		0	0	
		Electrician	2	0		0	0	
		Driver(LD)	4	2		0	0	
		CCS Technicians	4	0		0	0	
		Helper	4	12		8	4	
		V/T Operator	4	4		0	0	
		Driver(HD)	4	0		4	0	
		O2 operator	0	0		4	0	
		Safety Officer	4	4		4	2	
Ref Sr#	**Parameter**	**Details**	**ANABEEB**	**BRIDGE**	**EXPERTISE**	**ISOL**	**POLY TECH**	**Remarks**
Comments			Provided separate Equipment loading for both furnace	Provided separate Equipment loading for both furnace	Provided combined Equipment loading for both furnace	Provided separate Equipment loading for both furnace	Provided separate Equipment loading for both furnace	
7	Logistics & Equipment Resources	**Total Count- Equipment Loading**	**28**	**28**	**40**	**12**	**8**	
		Skip-40Ft	2				0	
		Compressor 750 CFM / Air compressor	2	4			0	
		Air Compressor 350 CFM			2	2	2	
		Air Dryer / After cooler	2	2		2	0	
		Air Hoses per Mtr	As required	As required	Lot	As required	0	
		Hoses 2 " Per Mtr	As required		Lot		0	
		Hoses 4 " per Mtr	As required		Lot		0	
		Field lab	2				0	
		Lighting	4				0	
		Vaccum Truck / Dry super sucker / super sucker	6	2	1	2	1	
		Supply Truck 15 ton			1		0	
		Trailer	2				0	
		Material container	2				0	
		tool container 20 ft			2		0	
		Crystal Dust Machine/ Crystal Blasting Machine / Dry Ice pellet blasting machine		4	2	4	2	Anabeeb *Bridge Crystal dust machine* *Expertise Crystal Blasting machine with accesries* *ISOL Dry Ice CO2 Pellet Blasting Equipment* *Polytech Crystal Cleaning Equipment Set*
		Dry Ice pallet				As required	0	
		Air moisturizer		2			0	
		Air movers		12			0	
		Tool Box / Wheel tool Box	6	2		As required	2	
		SCBA / Breathing apparatus		As required		2	0	
		Fire Extinguisher-6kg			6		0	
		Chemical spill kits			4		0	
		Fittings(as and when required for crystal blasting machine)			Lot	As required	0	
		PPE and MSDS			Lot		0	
		Electric generator			1		0	
		Tower Light			2		0	
		Mini Bus (28 seater)			1		0	
		Diesel tanker - 2000 galon			1		0	
		Waste Effluent tanks - 75 m3			8		0	
		Jumbo Bags					As required	
		First Aid box			4		0	
		Pick-up			2		0	
		safetty shower			2		0	
		Site office			1		1	

S. No.	Reference	S-Chem's comment	Bidder's Response	S-Chem's comment	Bidder's Response	S-Chem's comment	Bidder's Response	S-Chem's comment
1	Technical Proposal, Point 1	What is TSOL full form. Previously the Furnace F-3301 was cleaned by Air Cool Experts in S-Chem. Please confirm is this the same company collaborating with Bridge.	TSOL stands for Technical Solutions, Air Cooler Expers was owned by Bridge Saudi Company now its name changed to TSOL.	Closed				
2	Technical Proposal, Point 4.2.1	The term Fluidized mineral crystal is used. Is the mineral crystal is fluid type which will wet the surface. Please Confirm	our chemical is fine crsytaline powder which is developed to remove debris from multiple layers of finned tubes, and deliver excellent cleaning results on furnace and process heater convection coils. This ensures the highest quality cleaning of all tube layers, even with restricted access. Since the chemical we are using is completely dry form , there is no risk of damage to the refractory or insulation, nor of corrosion from water mixing with ash.	Since it is mentioned, water mixing with ash. Please confirm whether water will be mixed.	Please ignore and Consider our chemical is fine crsytaline dry powder as we briefed and so no use of water and mixing with ash.	Closed		
3	Technical Proposal, Point 5.8	Damper at the stack will be isolated. Contractor should have the required draft to lift up the Pulverized fouling particles. Please confirm what is the Contractor plan for the same to arrange.	we will install airmovers at all the accessable manways to remove the falllig particles from inside.	Closed				
4	Technical Proposal, Point 7.3	Scope of work is LUMPSUM. So contractor should consider all conditions lightly bonded and bonded fouling. Therefore, the bonded fouling is also as part of LUMPSUM scope and so include the same in the timeline and cost. Please confirm.	Confirmed	Closed				
5	Technical Proposal, Point 8.10	Ventilation for the Confined space entry will be provided by S-Chem. If any requirement like draft to lift up or blowers etc. during cleaning will be under contractor scope. Please confirm.	confirmed	Closed				
6	Technical Proposal, Point 8.13	This clause to be removed from proposal since it is generic and not Scope specific.	Confirmed	Closed				
7	Technical Proposal, Schedule	Schedule provided is showing the F-3301 and F-3201 as per parrallel jobs. F-3301 is expected to start cleaning tentative on 20th Jan. 2024 based on Plant shutdown on 07th Jan. 2024 F-3201 is expected to start cleaning tentative on 22th Jan. 2024 based on Plant shutdown on 07th Jan. 2024. Please provide the tentative schedule based on the tentive timeline provided with respect to each furance seperately for technical evalution.	In order to prepare the schedule,client need to Provide the exact window, kindly Provide total window for each unit, so we can prepare our schedule.Further to this we ensure to meet the S Chem schedule for furnace cleaning.	Total window will be based on Bridge confirmation, required for cleaning day and night shift 24/7 from start date provided by S-Chem. This time window after PO will be refined to combine with the Furnace overall window.	We have considerd 12 days (day & nighy shifts) to clean each Furnace & accepted S CHEM requirement to clean the both furnaces in parallell. So we already increased our resources in manpower and loading charts as shared.	Closed		
8	Technical Proposal, Manpower	Manpower loading is combined for F-3301 and F-3201 respectively. Since the timeline have different start date and are near to parallel. Please provided updated Manpower loading seperately for F-3301 and F-3201 repsectively. If any manpower is common which is not directly involved then provide as common.	Please see attached revised Manpower loading Charts separatley for F-3301 & F-3201	Please include SME in Manpower loading chart as confirmed in Query point 13 to have SME from TSOL air cooler expert from UK who supported in pervious TA 2018. Please update and send the manpower loading chart.	SME included, Please see revised manpower loading chart as attached.	SME from TSOL air cooler expert from UK should be available during Pre-TA and TA execution. Please confirm.	Confirmed.	Closed
9	Technical Proposal, Equipment	Equipment loading is combined for F-3301 and F-3201 respectively. Since the timeline have different start date and are near to parallel. Please provide updated Equipment loading seperately for F-3301 and F-3201 repsectively. If any equipment is common which is not directly involved then provide as common.	Please see attached revised Manpower loading Charts separatley for F-3301 & F-3201	Closed				
10	Technical Proposal, Method statement Point 12 No. 07	Office space or BRM will be provided by S-Chem. Therefore Contractor can exclude from their responsibility.	confirmed	Closed				
11	Technical Proposal, Method statement Point 18 m	Apart from Visual inspection, Contractor should have borescope inspection to share the cleaning efficiency after cleaning for the tube in F-3301 and F-3201. Please confirm.	confirmed	Closed				
12	Based on Technical Meeting dated 11th May 2023 10:00am-10:30am MS team with Bridge and S-Chem	Kindly confirm if this job is in collaboration with external partner or will be wholly done by Bridge	complete scope will be executed by Bridge.	Closed				
13	Based on Technical Meeting dated 11th May 2023 10:00am-10:30am MS team with Bridge and S-Chem	As mentioned in the meeting , Kindly confirm the availability of experienced SMEs(Subject matter experts) outside KSA from TSOL during the execution of the job preferably the SMEs that performed the job earlier at S-Chem	Confirmed.	Please include in Manpower loading chart and send updated manpower loading chart.	SME included, Please see revised manpower loading chart as attached.	Closed		
14	Based on Technical Meeting dated 11th May 2023 10:00am-10:30am MS team with Bridge and S-Chem	Since the time line for the F-3301 and F-3201 is days difference. Therefore, kindly conform availability of parallel crews for both Furnace to perform the job.	confirmed	Closed				
15	Based on Technical Meeting dated 11th May 2023 10:00am-10:30am MS team with Bridge and S-Chem	As suggested by Process engineering we require BRIDGE to submit the Report for the performance of before and after cleaning. Please confirm.	confirmed, Existing data of before and after cleaning will be Provided by Operation in order to generate the report.	Last TA the report from Air cooler experts was submitted after cleaning. As informed by process engineer, SME from Air cooler expert is required who will have process experience to support the report and confirmation before and after cleaning. After start up of Furnace, S-Chem will check actaul based Bridge reports.	Confirmed.	Closed		
16	General	Contractor should have Fit certiifcate for BA technician to use Breathing apparratus from approved 3rd Contractor like Total safety, etc;. Please confirm.	confirmed.	Closed				

S. No.	Reference	S-Chem's comment	Bidder's Response	S-Chem's comment
1	Technical Proposal, Point 5.4	This will be the reponsibility of Contractor ANABEEB. S-Chem will have no role to support this activity.	We are checking with concerned authority for approvals and will revert back shortly.	Anabeeb did give a firm rrepsonse to confirm for the query
2	Technical Proposal, Point 5.8	Permit will be issued by S-Chem. Permit recieiver will be from Anabeeb. Please confirm.	Noted and confirmed	Closed
3	Technical Proposal, Point 5.9	Since there is no Plant Air in S-Chem, Compressors for compressed air is under contractor Anbeeb scope. This should be removed. Please confirm	Noted and confirmed	Closed

S. No.	Reference	S-Chem's comment	Bidder's Response	S-Chem's comment
1	Technical Proposal, Manpower	Manpower loading is combined for F-3301 and F-3201 respectively. Since the timeline have different start date and are near to parallel. Please provided updated Manpower loading seperately for F-3301 and F-3201 repsectively. If any manpower is common which is not directly involved then provide as common.	Please find the attached	Closed
2	Technical Proposal, Equipment	Equipment loading is combined for F-3301 and F-3201 respectively. Since the timeline have different start date and are near to parallel. Please provide updated Equipment loading seperately for F-3301 and F-3201 repsectively. If any equipment is common which is not directly involved then provide as common.	Please find the attached	Closed